

Research Brief EPL IMPACT



Presented by Dr Taehee CHOI School outsourcing to third party education service providers



choith@eduhk.hk



www.eduhk.hk/epl





Department of Education Policy and Leadership

教育政策與領導學系



The Joseph Lau Luen Hung Charitable Trust Asia Pacific Centre for Leadership and Change 劉舉推恭美慧全 75大德過顯嬰美丽ዏ中順



Introduction

The Hong Kong government allocates grants to publicly-funded schools to receive outsourced education services and programmes from private providers including commercial enterprises and NGOs. These grants aim to promote new reforms, equitable education for marginalised groups of students and reduce teachers' workload. Schools and individual teachers decide which programmes/services to buy: whether pre-made, customised with school input, or developed from scratch.

This research investigated the development and role of outsourcing in Hong Kong publiclyfunded secondary schools and how providers collaboratively work with schools to maximise student learning. Data were collected through (a) interviews with 4 policymakers; (b) government policy and school documents (from 137 of 471 Hong Kong local secondary schools); (c) survey responses from 67 of these schools; and (d) case studies at five schools (interviews with 24 school staff and 15 outsourcing staff teaching English; observation of seven programmes).

The findings showed that these teachers generally viewed outsourcing as helpful. Most of these teachers valued additional funding to support their teaching and address students' needs, thus, contributing to educational quality and equity. However, outsourcing unexpectedly increased their workload, contrary to the policy intention of reducing it. The selection of outsourced programmes was customised to needs of each school: schools serving underprivileged communities invested more in building basic English skills and developing teaching materials and programmes, while schools serving well off communities invested more in advanced skills programmes and preparation for competitions and performances. As a result, the extra courses purchased through outsourcing helped students in well-off community better, in developing their portfolios useful for college entrance. The differential quality monitoring practice across schools and programmes left the quality to chance, and further issues arose, which are discussed below.



Key Issues and Significant Findings

- Government regulations providing a too wide autonomy to schools in programme quality control.
- Inadequate communication and coordination between schools and outsourced providers, a necessary ingredient for successful partnership and student learning.
- Inadequate shared understanding of clear, measurable learning objectives.
- No relevant teacher professional development (PD) to prepare all parties to successfully manage outsourcing, from contracting, through monitoring and to evaluating programmes.
- Inadequate monitoring of less motivated outside service providers to customise their activities to individual schools' needs, increasing hidden costs and limiting student learning.
- Inequity when outsourcing teachers neglect needs of marginalised students (e.g., those with special educational needs (SEN) or limited language proficiency).
- Lack of sustainable outsourcing funds to encourage service providers' long-term investment into programme quality.



Main Stakeholders and Engagement with Them

Schools, third parties (service providers) and government officials in over 20 countries.

Dr. Choi held public forums and wrote 4 articles and reports for schools, third parties and service providers. She also advised over 20 member countries of the Asian Productivity Orgnisation and elsewhere, including the Philippines and South Korea, helping them implementing successful schooling in partnership with third parties, both online and offline, before and after the COVID-19 pandemic.





Recommendations for Policymakers

- Declare sustainability of outsource funds to enable service providers to plan long-term.
- Monitor the effects of outsourced education on student learning, as well as financial transparency and cost-efficiency.
- Provide professional development on the partnership to all parties, including outsourcing teachers.
- Publicize and Reward effective service providers, e.g., allow for long-term contracts.



Recommendations for Schools

- Integrate education outsourcing activities with school-wide planning, knowledge management and reviews.
- Specify learning outcomes in contracts, including contingency plans for inadequate services.
- Maintain communication with providers and work collaboratively throughout the programme.
- Provide feedback on the delivery at the beginning and middle rather than only at the end.
- Ensure that staff and students respect outsourcing teachers.



For more Information:

Academic publications:

- Choi, T.-H. (2018). English education in partnership with third parties: A case of equity in Hong Kong. In S.-O. Kweon & B. Spolsky (Eds.), *The Asian EFL classroom: Issues, challenges and future expectations* (pp. 169-188). Routledge. (<u>Click to read</u>)
- Bates, A., Choi, T.-H., & Kim, Y. (2021). Outsourcing education services in South Korea, England and Hong Kong: A discursive institutionalist analysis. Compare: A Journal of Comparative Education, 51 (2), 259-277. (<u>Click to read</u>)

Wider dissemination of the findings:

Choi, T.-H. (2019). Education in partnership with third parties: Lessons from Hong Kong. APO, *Education reform for the future of work: The shift to a knowledge society* (11-17). Asian Productivity Organization. (<u>Click to read</u>)

7



For more Information:

Practical tips for the government, schools and businesses:

- Choi, T.-H., Walker, A., Tang, S. Y. F., Ko, J., & Chiu, C. S. (2018). *Report on outsourcing of education in Hong Kong*. The Education University of Hong Kong. (Click to read)
- 2 Choi, T.-H. (with Li, W.) (2017). *Toward a better partnership between schools and educational companies (I): What schools think*. The Education University of Hong Kong. (<u>Click to read</u>)

Newspaper articles:

- 崔太僖 (2017):認真看待外判教育:問題剖析及實用策略,《教育專業》,頁14-15。
- 崔太僖 (2017):「外判教育」用得其所?, 信報財經新聞。



For more Information:

For any inquries, please contact Dr Taehee CHOI by <u>choith@eduhk.hk</u>.



